

**Dissertation Title:**

Exploring nonnative-English-speaking teachers' experiences in teaching English at a U.S. university

**Researcher:**

Takaharu Saito

The University of Arizona, Tuscon

[tasaito@rku.ac.jp](mailto:tasaito@rku.ac.jp)

**Research Supervisor:**

Dr. Teresa L. McCarty



Dr. Takaharu Saito

---

**Summary:**

The purpose of this dissertation is to examine how nonnative English teachers' identity constructions develop and influence their pedagogy in U.S. higher education. The research on nonnative teachers of English has not adequately explored their identity constructions. This study relied on a phenomenological case study approach that analyzed the lived experience of nonnative English teachers in relation to wider language ideologies and practices. Data were generated from spring 2003 to fall 2003 through phenomenological in-depth interviews, classroom observations, questionnaires, and autobiographical accounts of research participants. The data were primarily analyzed through the use of the constant comparative method.

The study reveals that identity construction among nonnative English teachers, with its dynamic and contradictory nature, remains challenging, changing, and growing over time in relations of wider language ideologies and practices. Thus, the findings reject a fixed, unitary, and monolithic view on the identity construction of nonnative English teachers. In terms of the study's practical and pedagogical implications, university programs should know that nonnative English teachers can practice mutual accommodation through which both nonnative English teachers and their students can collaborate in order to improve the learning of English and enrich diversity within U.S. higher education. University programs should also focus more on what nonnative English teachers can do in collaboration with native English teachers. Finally, this study suggests that language educators should explore the role nonnative English teachers play in language pedagogy in an era of the global spread of English that produces highly proficient nonnative English speaking professionals.

## References

- Adger, C. (1995). Issues and implications of English dialects for TESOL. Unpublished manuscript.
- Amin, N. (1997). Race and the identity of the nonnative ESL teacher. *TESOL Quarterly*, 31(3), 580-583.
- Amin, N. (1999). Minority women teachers of ESL: Negotiating white English. In G. Braine (Ed.), *Non-native educators in English language teaching* (pp.93-104). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Amin, N. (2004). Nativism, the native speaker construct, and minority immigrant women teachers of English as a second language. In L. D. Kamhi-Stein (Ed.), *Learning and teaching from experience* (pp. 61-80). Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press.
- Atkinson, D. (1999). TESOL and culture. *TESOL Quarterly*, 33(4), 625-654.
- Belcher, D., & Connor, U. (Eds.) (2001). *Reflections on multiliterate lives*. Clevedon, England: Multilingual Matters.
- Berlin, L. N. (2000). *Toward a "working definition" of effective language instruction in the multicultural ESL classroom*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Arizona, Tucson.
- Bourdieu, P. (1977). The economics of linguistic exchanges. *Social Science Information*, 16, 645-668.
- Bourdieu, P. (1986). The forms of capital. In J. G. Richardson (Ed.), *Handbook of theory and research for the sociology of education*. New York, NY: Greenwood Press.
- Bourdieu, P. (1991). *Language and symbolic power*. Translated by G. Raymond & M. Adamson. Cambridge, MA: Polity Press.
- Braine, G. (1999). From the periphery to the center: One teacher's journey. In G. Braine (Ed.), *Non-native educators in English language teaching* (pp.15-27). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Braine, G. (2004). The nonnative English-speaking professionals' movement and its research foundations. In L. D. Kamhi-Stein (Ed.), *Learning and teaching from experience* (pp. 9-24). Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press.
- Brown, P., & Levinson, S. C. (1978). *Politeness: Some universals in language use*. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.

- Brutt-Griffler, J., & Samimy, K.K. (1999). Revisiting the colonial in the postcolonial: Critical praxis for nonnative-English-speaking teachers in a TESOL program. *TESOL Quarterly*, 33(3), 413-431.
- Canagarajah, A. S. (1999). Interrogating the “Native speaker fallacy”: Non-linguistic roots, non-pedagogical results. In G. Braine (Ed.), *Non-native educators in English language teaching* (pp.77-92). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Carr, W., & Kemmis, S. (1986). *Becoming critical: Education, knowledge, and action research*. London, England: Falmer Press.
- Cook, V. (1999). Going beyond the native speaker in language teaching. *TESOL Quarterly*, 33(2), 185-209.
- Crandall, J. (1992). Adult literacy development. In W. Grabe (Ed.), *Annual review of applied linguistics* (pp. 86-104). New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.
- Creswell, J. W., & Miller, D. L. (2000). Determining validity in qualitative inquiry. *Theory into practice*, 39(3), 124-130.
- Crystal, D. (1985). How many millions? The statistics of English today. *English today*, 1(1), 7-9.
- Cummins, J. (1996). *Negotiating identities: Education for empowerment in a diverse society*. Ontario, CA: California Association for Bilingual Education.
- Davies, A. (1991). *The Native Speaker in Applied Linguistics*. Edinburgh, Scotland: Edinburgh University Press.
- Davies, A. (2003). *The native speaker: Myth and reality*. New York, NY: Multilingual Matters.
- Duff, P., & Uchida, Y. (1997). The negotiation of teachers’ sociocultural identities and practices in postsecondary EFL classrooms. *TESOL Quarterly*, 31(3), 451-486.
- Edge, J. (1988). Natives, speakers, and models. *JALT Journal* 9(2), 153-157.
- Fairclough, N. (1989). *Language and power*. New York, NY: Longman.
- Foucault, M. (1978). *The history of sexuality, volume I: An introduction*. New York, NY: Vintage Books.
- Giles, H., & Johnson, P. (1981). The role of language in ethnic group relations. In J.C. Turner & H. Giles (Eds.), *Intergroup behavior* (pp. 199-243). Oxford, England: Basil Blackwell.

- Giles, H., & Johnson, P. (1987). Ethnolinguistic identity theory: A social psychological approach to language maintenance. *International journal of the sociology of language*, 68, 69-99.
- Glaser, B. G. & Strauss, A. L. (1967). *The Discovery of Grounded Theory: Strategies for Qualitative Research*. Chicago: Aldine Publishing Company.
- Goetz, J. P., & LeCompte, M. D. (1984). *Ethnography and qualitative design in educational research*. Orlando, FL: Academic Press, Inc.
- Gumperz, J. J. (1982). *Discourse strategies*. Cambridge, MA: Cambridge University Press.
- Gumperz, J. J., & Cook-Gumperz, J. (1982). Introduction: Language and the communication of social identity. In J. J. Gumperz (Ed.), *Language and social identity* (pp. 1-22). Cambridge, MA: Cambridge University Press.
- Heath, S. B. (1989). Language ideology. In *International encyclopedia of communication*, Vol. 2, (pp. 393-395). New York, NY: Oxford University Press.
- Heller, M. (1982). *Language, ethnicity, and politics in Quebec*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of California, Berkeley.
- Irvine, J. T. (1989). When talk isn't cheap: Language and political economy. *American ethnologist*, 16, 248 – 267.
- Johnson, D. M. (1992). *Approaches to research in second language learning*. White Plains, NY: Longman.
- Kachru, B. B., & Nelson, C. L. (1996). World Englishes. In S. L. McKay & N. H. Hornberger (Eds.), *Sociolinguistics and language teaching* (pp. 71-102). New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.
- Kamhi-Stein, L. D. (1999). Preparing non-native professionals in TESOL: Implications for teacher education programs. In G. Braine (Ed.), *Non-native educators in English language teaching* (pp.145-158). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Kramsch, C., & Lam, E. (1999). Textual identities: The importance of being non-native. In G. Braine (Ed), *Non-native educators in English language teaching* (pp.57-71). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Kresovich, B. M. (1988). *Error gravity: Perceptions of native-speaking and non-native-speaking faculty in EFL*. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 311732)
- Kubota, R. (2002). Marginality as an asset: Toward a counter-hegemonic pedagogy for

- diversity. In L. Vargas (Ed.), *Women faculty of color in the white classroom* (pp. 293-307). New York, NY: Peter Lang.
- LeCompte, M. D., & Preissle, J., with Tesch, R. (1993). *Ethnography and qualitative design in educational research* (2nd ed.). San Diego, CA: Academic Press.
- Lenneberg, E. (1967). *Biological foundation of language*. New York, NY: Wiley.
- Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E.G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Lippi-Green, R. (1994). Accent, standard language ideology, and discriminatory pretext in the courts. *Language in society*, 23, 163-198.
- Liu, D. (1999). Training non-native TESOL students: Challenges for TESOL teacher education in the West. In G. Braine (Ed), *Non-native educators in English language teaching* (pp.197-210). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Liu, J. (1999a). Nonnative-English-speaking professionals in TESOL. *TESOL Quarterly*, 33(1), 85-102.
- Liu, J. (1999b). From their own perspectives: The impact of non-native ESL professionals on their students. In G. Braine (Ed.), *Non-native educators in English language teaching* (pp. 159-176). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Liu, J. (2004). Confessions of a nonnative English-speaking professional. In L. D. Kamhi-Stein (Ed.), *Learning and teaching from experience* (pp. 25-39). Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press.
- Mason, J. (1996). *Qualitative researching*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications.
- McCarty, T. L. (2002). *A place to be Navajo: Rough Rock and the struggle for self-determination in indigenous schooling*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- McCarty, T. L. (2002, October). *Ethnography of social justice*. Talk presented at the LRC Brown Bag presentation series.
- McKay, S. L. (1996). Literacy and literacies. In S. L. McKay & N. H. Hornberger (Eds.), *Sociolinguistics and language teaching* (pp. 421-445). Cambridge, MA: Cambridge University Press.
- McNamara, T. (1997). What do we mean by social identity? Competing frameworks, competing discourses. *TESOL Quarterly*, 31(3), 561-567.
- McNeill, A. (1994). *Some characteristics of native and non-native speaker teachers of English*. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 386067)

- Medgyes, P. (1992). Native or non-native: who's worth more? *ELT journal*, 46(4), 340-349.
- Medgyes, P. (1994). *The non-native teacher*. London, England: Macmillan.
- Medgyes, P. (1999). Language training: A neglected area in teacher education. In G. Braine (Ed), *Non-native educators in English language teaching* (pp. 177-195). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum
- Merriam, S. B. (1988). *Case study research in education: A qualitative approach*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- Merriam, S. B. (1998). *Qualitative research and case study applications in education*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- Morgan, B. (1997). Identity and intonation: Linking dynamic process in an ESL classroom. *TESOL Quarterly*, 31(3), 431-450.
- Nieto, S. (2000). *Affirming diversity: The sociopolitical context of multicultural education* (3rd ed.). New York, NY: Longman.
- Norton, B. (1997). Language, identity, and the ownership of English. *TESOL Quarterly*, 31(3), 409-429.
- Norton, B. (2000). *Identity and language learning: Gender, ethnicity, and educational change*. New York, NY: Pearson Education.
- Ochs, E. (1993). Constructing social identity: A language socialization perspective. *Research on language and social interaction*, 26, 287-306.
- Oda, M. (1999). English only or English plus? The Language(s) of EFL Organizations. In G. Braine (Ed.), *Non-native educators in English language teaching* (pp. 105-121). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Patton, M. Q. (1990). *Qualitative evaluation and research methods* (2nd ed.). Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Pawley, A., & Syder, F. H. (1983). The two puzzles for linguistic theory: Nature-like selection and nature-like fluency. In J. C. Richards & R. Schmidt (Eds.), *Language and Communication*. London, England: Harlow
- Peirce, B. N. (1995). Social identity, investment, and language learning. *TESOL Quarterly*, 29(1), 9-31.
- Rampton, M. B. H. (1990). Displacing the 'native speaker': expertise, affiliation, and inheritance. *ELT journal*, 44, 97-101.

- Ricento, T. K., & Hornberger, N. H. (1996). Unpeeling the onion: Language planning and policy and the ELT professional. *TESOL quarterly*, 30(3), 401-427.
- Richards, J. C., & Lockhart, C. (1994). *Reflective teaching in second language classrooms*. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.
- Richards, J. C., & Nunan, D. (Eds.) (1990). *Second language teacher education*. New York, NY: Cambridge University Press.
- Rossmann, G. B., & Rallis, S. F. (1998). *Learning in the field: An introduction to qualitative research*. Thousand Oaks, CA & London, England: Sage.
- Rubin, D. L. (1992). Nonlanguage factors affecting undergraduates' judgments of nonnative English-speaking teaching assistants. *Research in Higher Education*, 33(4), 511-531.
- Rubin, D. L., & Smith, K. A. (1990). Effects of accent, ethnicity, and lecture topic on undergraduates' perceptions of nonnative English-speaking teaching assistants. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 14, 337-353.
- Ruiz, R. (1984). Orientations in language planning. *NABE Journal*, 8(2), 15-34.
- Rumsey, A. (1990). Wording, meaning, and linguistic ideology. *American Anthropologist*, 92, 346-361.
- Seidman, I. E. (1998). *Interviewing as qualitative research: A guide for researchers in education and the social sciences* (2nd ed.). New York, NY & London, England: Teachers College Press.
- Sherman, R. R., & Webb, R. B. (1988). Qualitative research in education: A focus. In R. R. Sherman & R. B. Webb (Eds.), *Qualitative research in education: Focus and methods*. Bristol, Pa.: Falmer Press.
- Silverstein, M. (1979). Language structure and linguistic ideology. In P. R. Clyne et al. (Eds.), *The element: A parapsession on linguistic units and levels* (pp. 193-247). Chicago, IL: Chicago Linguistic Society.
- Spradley, J. P. (1980). *Participant observation*. New York, NY: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.
- Stake, R. E. (1988). Case study methods in educational research: Seeking sweet water. In R. M. Jaeger (Ed.), *Complementary methods for research in education* (pp. 253-278). Washington, DC: American Educational Research Association.
- Stevens, P. (1992). English as an international language: Directions in the 1990s. In

- B.B.Kachru (Ed.), *The other tongue: English across cultures* (2nd ed.) ( pp.27-47).
- Tajfel, H. (1974). Social identity and intergroup behavior. *Social Science Information*, 13, 65-93.
- Tajfel, H. (1981). *Human groups and social categories*. Cambridge, MA: Cambridge University Press.
- Thesen, L. (1997). Voices, discourse, and transition: In search of new categories in EAP. *TESOL Quarterly*, 31(3), 487-511.
- Thomas, J. (1999). Voices from the periphery: Non-native teachers and issues of credibility. In G. Braine (Ed.), *Non-native educators in English language teaching* (pp. 5-13). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Vargas, L. (2002). My classroom in its context: The struggle for multiculturalism. In L. Vargas (Ed.), *Women faculty of color in the white classroom* (pp. 35-54). New York, NY: Peter Lang.
- Weedon, C. (1987). *Feminist practice and poststructuralist theory*. London, England: Blackwell.
- West, C. (1992). A matter of life and death. *October*, 61, 20-23.
- Widdowson, H. G. (1994). The ownership of English. *TESOL Quarterly*, 28(2), 377-389.
- Wiley, T.G., & Lukes, M. (1996). English-Only and standard English ideologies in the U.S. *TESOL Quarterly*, 30(3), 511-535.
- Wink, J. (2000). *Critical Pedagogy: Notes from the real world* (2nd ed.). New York, NY: Longman.
- Woolard, K. A. (1998). Introduction: Language ideology as a field of inquiry. In B. B. Schieffelin et al. (Eds.), *Language ideologies: Practice and theory* (pp. 3-47). Oxford, MA: Oxford University Press.