

Title of Project:

A Cultural Balancing Act: The Learning, Beliefs, and Practices of Novice Indonesian Teachers of English

Researcher:

Tabitha Kidwell
University of Maryland, College Park
tabithakidwell@gmail.com



Tabitha Kidwell

Research Supervisor:

Dr. Megan Madigan Percy
University of Maryland, College Park

Final Report

Motivation for the Research

The emergence of English as a global language means that English is increasingly the medium of interaction for cross-cultural exchanges. By teaching English, teachers are preparing students for encounters with people from different cultures – with both monolingual speakers of English and multilingual speakers from diverse backgrounds. Culture is a central part of language study because culture and language are inextricably linked (Agar, 1994; Kramsch, 1993). Language classrooms, therefore, are almost always sites of cultural contact, where language teachers act as “cultural workers” (Giroux, 2005, p. 71) because they help students understand the nature of culture and culture’s impact on communication. English teachers must be prepared to attend to the cultural aspects of learning a foreign language.

In Indonesia, this challenge is compounded by education policies that explicitly require English teachers to sustain Indonesian cultural values. An example of this policy is the required focus on character education within the 2013 English curriculum (Badan Standard Nasional Pendidikan, 2013). Thus, novice Indonesian teachers of English encounter two potentially conflicting demands as they begin their career: the need to sustain Indonesian cultural values while also guiding students through the cross-cultural challenges of learning another language. Without explicit preparation or guidance regarding these two expectations, new teachers may struggle to teach effectively about both local and unfamiliar cultures.

Research Questions

This study examines the issues described above by investigating the following research questions:

1. How do Indonesian teachers of English learn to teach about culture?
2. What beliefs do novice Indonesian teachers of English hold regarding teaching about culture?
3. What practices do novice Indonesian teachers of English use to teach about culture?

Research Methodology

I employed ethnographic methods to conduct a qualitative case study of teacher preparation practices within the Department of English Education and Teacher Training at Central Java Islamic University (CJIU, a pseudonym). The overall case study was complemented by embedded case studies (Yin, 2009)

of 14 novice teachers who had graduated from the teacher education program within the last four years. Data were collected between August 2017 and March 2018, and informed consent was obtained from each participant at the time of their enrollment in the study. Participants were 20 university faculty members, 21 current students and 20 recently graduated novice teachers. The first segment of the project focused on the teacher education context to investigate the first research question. Data collection procedures for this segment included the following: (1) review of 19 CIJU course syllabi, (2) 33 CIJU course observations, (3) 28 faculty interviews, (4) three group and 10 individual interviews with novice teachers, (5) 156 novice teacher journal entries, and (6) five group interviews with current students. The second segment of the project focused on the embedded cases of focal novice teachers to answer Research questions two and three. Data collection procedures for this segment were as follows: (1) 64 observations of, (2) 62 interviews with and ongoing document collection from 14 focal novice teachers, (3) six professional learning community (PLC) sessions with novice teacher participants, and (4) 156 journal entries from novice teacher participants. Lesson observations were audio-recorded and field notes were taken; interviews were audio-recorded, transcribed, and translated (if necessary); PLC meetings were video- and audio-recorded and transcribed; and copies were obtained of course syllabi, journal entries, and relevant teaching materials. I conducted iterative data analysis using Atlas.ti, a data management program, to apply codes to portions of the data that revealed emerging concepts of interest. I used the constant comparative method (Corbin & Strauss, 2014) to compare and compile these coded concepts and, thereby, identify important themes in the data. I drew on those themes to develop case descriptions of each novice teacher participant, then conducted a cross-case analysis (Yin, 2009) to identify similarities and differences across cases.

Summary of Findings

Findings showed that Indonesian English teachers had many opportunities to learn about culture, both within and outside of coursework, but they rarely learned methods to teach their students about the concept of culture. Consequently, many did not include unfamiliar cultural content in their lessons, nor did they make efforts to develop their students' intercultural competence. Concerning novice teachers' beliefs and practices, this study identifies participants as falling into one of two groups, differentiated by their access to and investment in cultural learning opportunities. *Locally-oriented* teachers defined culture as an "inheritance" or "traditions," saw the goal of culture instruction as fostering appropriate behavior, and perceived a possible negative influence from foreign cultures. Their practices were mostly linguistically-focused; and though they, at times, made connections to students' own lives, they rarely addressed unfamiliar or new cultures. *Globally-oriented* teachers defined culture as the actions and beliefs of a given community and believed that language teachers should teach about unfamiliar cultures. They considered preparation to interact with foreigners and the development of respect for others as goals of culture instruction. They were more likely to make connections to unfamiliar cultures by discussing texts, telling students about new cultures, and contextualizing language within unfamiliar cultural contexts. One distinguishing factor between *locally-oriented* and *globally-oriented* teachers was each teacher's own participation in intercultural experiences. The novice teachers that were willing to teach about new and unfamiliar cultures, despite contextual factors and limited preparation, were those who had had intercultural experiences themselves.

Implications

This research makes an important contribution to the field because it highlights the need for language teacher education programs to help novice teachers learn to teach about culture, as well as the importance of offering intercultural experiences to novice teachers before and during their early careers. The distinction between *locally-oriented* teachers and *globally-oriented* teachers is a new

contribution to the field, and it is a contribution that may allow language teacher educators to more effectively prepare language teachers to address cultural content and develop their students' intercultural competence. This study shows that language teachers may struggle to address cultural demands without adequate preparation to do so and that personal intercultural experiences can help novice teachers balance the need to teach their students about unfamiliar cultures while also sustaining the local culture. Therefore, teacher education programs should provide more concrete guidance about how to teach about culture and should support novice teachers' participation in intercultural experiences. In the future, more focused preparation efforts regarding teaching about culture could allow novice teachers to more effectively prepare their students to meaningfully engage across cultural differences.

Final Report References

- Agar, M. (1994). *Language shock: The culture in everyday conversations*. New York, NY: Morrow.
- Badan Standar Nasional Pendidikan (2013). *Standar Kompetensi dan Kompetensi Dasar*. Jakarta, Indonesia: Kemendikbud.
- Corbin, J. & Strauss, A., (2014). *Basics of qualitative research: Techniques and procedures for developing grounded theory* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Giroux, H. A. (2005). *Border crossings: Cultural workers and the politics of education* (2nd ed.). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Kramsch, C. (1993). *Context and culture in language teaching*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case study research* (4th ed.). Los Angeles, CA: Sage.

Doctoral Dissertation References

- ACTFL/CAEP. (2013). *ACTFL/CAEP program standards for the preparation of foreign language teachers*. Alexandria, VA: American Council on the Teaching of Foreign Languages.
- Adaskou, K., Britten, D., & Fahsi, B. (1990). Design decisions on the cultural content of a secondary English course for Mororcco. *ELT Journal*, 44(1), 3-10.
- Agar, M. (1994). *Language shock: The culture in everyday conversations*. New York, NY: Morrow.
- Alptekin, C. (2002). Towards intercultural communicative competence in ELT. *ELT Journal*, 56(1), 57–64.
- Atay, D., Kurt, G., Camlibel, Z., Ersin, P., & Kaslioglu, O. (2009). The role of intercultural competence in foreign language teaching. *Inonu University Journal of the Faculty of Education*, 10(3), 123–135.
- Atkinson, D. (1999). TESOL and culture. *TESOL Quarterly*, 33(4), 625–654.
- Bachman, L. F., & Palmer, A. S. (1996). *Language testing in practice: Designing and developing useful language tests*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Badan Standar Nasional Pendidikan (2013). *Standar Kompetensi dan Kompetensi Dasar*. Jakarta, Indonesia: Kemendikbud.
- Baker, W. (2011). From cultural awareness to intercultural awareness: Culture in ELT. *ELT Journal*, 66(1), 62–70. <http://doi.org/10.1093/elt/ccr017>
- Ball, D. L., & Forzani, F. M. (2008). What makes education research "educational"? *Educational Researcher*, 36(9), 529–540. <http://doi.org/10.3102/0013189X01723896>
- Ball, D. L., & Forzani, F. M. (2009). The work of teaching and the challenge for teacher education. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 60(5), 497–511. <http://doi.org/10.1177/0022487109348479>
- Bambino, D. (2002). Critical friends. *Educational Leadership*, 59(6), 25-27.
- Bandura, A. (1997). *Self-efficacy: The exercise of control*. New York, NY: W. H. Freeman.
- Banks, J. A. (1993). *Multicultural education: Issues and perspectives*. Needham Height, MA: Allyn & Bacon.
- Banks, J. A. (1994). *Multiethnic education: Theory and practice*. Needham Heights, MA: Allyn & Bacon.
- Banks, J. (2002) *Cultural diversity and education: Foundations, curriculum, and teaching* (4th ed.). New York, NY: John Wiley & Sons.
- Baral, D. P., Snow, R. E., & Allen, E. W. (1968). *A taxonomy of teaching behaviors: Progress report* (Research and Development Memorandum No. 36, ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED049157). Stanford, CA: Stanford University School of Education. Retrieved from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED049157.pdf>

- Bartolome, L. I. (1994). Beyond the methods fetish: Toward a humanizing pedagogy. *Harvard Educational Review*, 64(2), 173–194.
- Baugh, J. (1999). *Out of the mouths of slaves: African American language and educational malpractice*. Austin, TX: University of Texas Press.
- Bayyurt, Y. (2006). Non-native English language teachers' perspective on culture in English as a foreign language classrooms. *Teacher Development*, 10(2), 233–247.
<http://doi.org/10.1080/13664530600773366>
- Bennett, J. M. (2014). *Diversity at work: The practice of inclusion*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Bennett, M. J. (1993). Towards ethnorelativism: A developmental model of intercultural sensitivity. In R. M. Paige (Ed.), *Education for the intercultural experience* (2nd ed., pp. 21-71). Yarmouth, ME: Intercultural Press.
- Berliner, D. (1994). Expertise: The wonder of exemplary performances. In J. Mangieri & C. C. Block (Eds.), *Creating powerful thinking in teachers and students: Diverse perspectives* (pp. 161-186). Fort Worth, TX: Harcourt Brace.
- Berman, R. C., & Tyyska, V. (2011). A critical reflection on the use of translators/interpreters in a qualitative cross-language research project. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 10(1), 178–190.
- Biswalo, U. P. (2015). *Exploring intercultural communicative competence among English language teachers in secondary schools in Tanzania: A postcolonial perspective*. (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Victoria University of Wellington, Wellington, New Zealand.
- Bjork, C. (2005). *Indonesian education: Teachers, schools, and central bureaucracy*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Bogdan, R. C., & Biklen, S. K. (2006). *Qualitative research for education: An introduction to theory and methods* (5th ed.). Boston, MA: Allyn & Bacon.
- Borg, S. (2003). Teacher cognition in language teaching: A review of research on what language teachers think, know, believe, and do. *Language Teaching*, 36(2), 81–109.
<http://doi.org/10.1017/S0261444803001903>
- Borko, H. (2004). Professional development and teacher learning: Mapping the terrain. *Educational Researcher*, 33(3), 3–15. <http://doi.org/10.3102/0013189X033008003>
- Borko, H., & Putnam, R. T. (1995). "Expanding a teacher's knowledge base: A cognitive psychological perspective on professional development". In T. R. Guskey & M. Huberman (Eds.), *Professional development in education: New paradigms and practices*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- Bourdieu, P., & Passeron, J. C. (1990). *Reproduction in education, society and culture*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

- Brouwer, N., & Korthagen, F. (2005). Can teacher education make a difference? *American Educational Research Journal*, 42(1), 153–224. <http://doi.org/10.3102/00028312042001153>
- Bullough, R., & Knowles, J. (1991). Teaching and nurturing: Changing conceptions of self as teacher in a case study of becoming a teacher. *Qualitative Studies in Education*, 4, 121-140.
- Bush, R. N. (1968, April). *Second annual report* (Annual Report No. 2, ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED024642). Stanford, CA: Stanford Center for Research and Development in Teaching. Retrieved from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED024642.pdf>
- Byram, M. (1997). *Teaching and assessing intercultural communicative competence*. Clevedon, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Byram, M., Conlon Perugini, D., & Wagner, M. (2013). The development of intercultural citizenship in the elementary school Spanish classroom. *Learning Languages*, (2), 16–31.
- Byram, M., & Feng, A. (2004). Culture and language learning: Teaching, research and scholarship. *Language Teaching*, 37(3), 149–168. <http://doi.org/10.1017/S0261444804002289>
- Byram, M., Golubeva, I., Han, H., & Wagner, M. (Eds.). (2018). *From principles to practice in education for intercultural citizenship*. Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Byram, M., & Risager, K. (1999). *Language teachers, politics and cultures*. Clevedon, UK: Multilingual Matters. <http://doi.org/10.1080/00313830802346405>
- Byram, M., & Wagner, M. (2018). Making a difference: Language teaching for intercultural and international dialogue. *Foreign Language Annals*, 51, 140–151. <http://doi.org/10.1111/flan.12319>
- Byrd, D. R. (2007). *Investigating how second language teachers are prepared to teach culture: An analysis of methods course syllabi* (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). University of Iowa, Iowa City, Iowa.
- Byrd, D. R., Hlas, A. C., Watzke, J., & Valencia, M. F. M. (2011). An examination of culture knowledge: A study of L2 teachers' and teacher educators' beliefs and practices. *Foreign Language Annals*, 44(1), 4–39.
- Canagarajah, A. S. (1999). *Resisting linguistic imperialism in English teaching*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Canagarajah, S. (2007). Lingua franca English, multilingual communities, and language acquisition. *The Modern Language Journal*, 91(s1), 923–939.
- Canale, M. (1983). From communicative competence to communicative language pedagogy. In J. C. Richards & R. W. Schmidt (Eds.), *Language and communication*. London, UK: Longman.
- Canale, M., & Swain, M. (1980). Theoretical bases of communicative approaches to second language teaching and testing. *Applied Linguistics*, 1(1), 1–47.

- Castro, P., Sercu, L., & Méndez García, M. D. C. (2004). Integrating language-and-culture teaching: An investigation of Spanish teachers' perceptions of the objectives of foreign language education. *Intercultural Education*, 15(1), 91–104. <http://doi.org/10.1080/1467598042000190013>
- Celce-Murcia, M., Dörnyei, Z., & Thurrell, S. (1995). Communicative competence: A pedagogically motivated model with content specifications. *Issues in Applied Linguistics*, 6(2), 5-35.
- Cem, M. A. (1984). The question of culture: EFL teaching in non-English-speaking countries. *ELT Journal*, 38(1), 14–20.
- Charters, W. W., & Waples, D. (1929). *The Commonwealth teacher training study*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- Chen, D., & Yang, X. (2016). Culture as the core: Challenges and possible solutions in integrating culture into foreign language teaching. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 7(1), 168–177. <http://doi.org/10.17507/jltr.0701.19>
- Chodidjah, I. (2008, January). *English in primary school: Gem in the mud in Indonesia*. Paper presented at the International Conference on Teaching English to Young Learners, Bangalore, India.
- Clifford, J. (1986). Introduction: Partial truths. In J. Clifford & G. Marcus (Eds.), *Writing culture: The poetics and politics of ethnography* (pp. 1–26). Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.
- Cochran-Smith, M., & Lytle, S. L. (1999). Relationships of knowledge and practice: Teacher learning in communities. In A. Iran-Nejar & P. D. Pearson (Eds.), *Review of research in education* (pp. 249–305). Washington, DC: American Educational Research Association.
- Cohen, D. K., & Hill, H. C. (1998). *Instructional policy and classroom performance: The mathematics reform in California* (RR-39). Philadelphia, PA: Consortium for Policy Research in Education.
- Cook, V. (1999). Going beyond the native speaker in language teaching. *TESOL Quarterly*, 33(2), 185–209.
- Corbett, J. (2003). *An intercultural approach to English language teaching*. Clevedon, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Corbin, J., & Strauss, A., (2014). *Basics of qualitative research: Techniques and procedures for developing grounded theory* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Council for Cultural Cooperation. (2000). *European Language Portfolio (ELP): Principles and Guidelines*. Strasbourg, France: Council of Europe. Retrieved from <http://culture.coe.int/portfolio>
- Council of Europe. (2001). *Common European framework of reference for languages: Learning, teaching and assessment*. Cambridge, UK: Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge.
- Council of Europe. (2017). *Common European Framework of Reference for Languages: Learning, teaching, assessment. Companion volume with new descriptors*. Strasbourg, France: Author.

- Creswell, J. W. (2009). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches*, (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Creswell, J. W., & Miller, D. L. (2000). Determining validity in qualitative inquiry. *Theory Into Practice*, 39(3), 124-130.
- Crystal, D. (1997). *English as a global language*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Curtain, H., & Dahlberg, C. A. (2016). *Languages and learning: Making the match: World language instruction in the K-8 classrooms and beyond* (5th ed.). Boston, MA: Pearson.
- Dardjowidjojo, S. (1998). Strategies for a successful national language policy: The Indonesian case. *International Journal of the Sociology of Language*, 130, 35-47.
- Darling-Hammond, L. (2000). How teacher education matters. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 51(3), 166-173.
- Darling-Hammond, L., Holtzman, D. J., Gatlin, S. J., & Heilig, J. V. (2005). Does teacher preparation matter? Evidence about teacher certification, Teach for America, and teacher effectiveness. *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 13(42), 1-51.
- Davies, A. (2003). *The native speaker: Myth and reality*. Clevedon, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Harper, C., & De Jong, E. (2004). Misconceptions about teaching English-language learners. *Journal of Adolescent & Adult Literacy*, 48(2), 152-162.
- de Jong, E. J., & Harper, C. A. (2005). Preparing mainstream teachers for English-language learners: Is being a good teacher good enough? *Teacher Education Quarterly*, 32(2), 101-124.
- Deardorff, D. K. (2006). Identification and assessment of intercultural competence as a student outcome of internationalization. *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 10(3), 241-266.
- Diaz-Greenberg, R., & Nevin, A. (2003). Listen to the voices of foreign language student teachers: Implications for foreign language educators. *Language and Intercultural Communication*, 3(3), 213-226. <http://doi.org/10.1080/14708470308668106>
- Duckworth, E. (1987). *"The having of wonderful ideas" and other essays on teaching and learning*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- Duff, P., & Uchida, Y. (1997). The negotiation of teachers' sociocultural identities and practices in postsecondary EFL classrooms. *TESOL Quarterly*, 31(3), 451-486.
- Dytynshyn, N., & Collins, L. (2012). Culture and interculturality in the adult ESL context in urban Quebec: A case study. *TESL Canada Journal/Revue TESL Du Canada*, 30(1), 45-68.
- Eisenhart, M. A., Cuthbert, A. M., Shrum, J. L., & Harding, J. R. (1988). Teacher beliefs about their work activities: Policy implications. *Theory Into Practice*, 27(2), 137-144.

- Elgar, A. G. (2011). Culture through literature in foreign language teaching. In J. Arabski, (Ed.), *Aspects of culture in second language acquisition and foreign language learning* (pp. 139–147). Berlin, Germany: Springer. http://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-642-20201-8_11
- Emerson, R. M., Fretz, R. I., & Shaw, L. L. (1995). Writing up fieldnotes II: Creating scenes on the page. In R. M. Emerson, R. I. Fretz, & L. L. Shaw (Eds.), *Writing ethnographic fieldnotes* (pp. 66–107). Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- Endrotomo. (2016). *Kisi-kisi mutu lulusan program study menurut konsep KKNI & SN DIKTI sebagai dasar penyusunan kurikulum*. Jakarta, Indonesia: Tim Belmawa RISTEKDIKTI.
- Ennsner-Kananen, J., & Wang, A. F. (2016). “I am combined”: Chinese teachers’ cultural identities and pedagogical learning. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 7(4), 625–634. <http://doi.org/10.17507/jltr.0704.01>
- Faisal, G. (2015, November 25). Boosting multi-lingual proficiency for educators. *The Jakarta Post*. Retrieved from <https://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2015/11/25/boosting-multi-language-proficiency-educators.html>
- Fang, F. G., & Baker, W. (2018). “A more inclusive mind towards the world”: English language teaching and study abroad in China from intercultural citizenship and English as a lingua franca perspectives. *Language Teaching Research*, 22(5), 608–624.
- Faulkner, S. L., Baldwin, J. R., Lindsley, S. L., & Hecht, M. L. (2006). Layers of meaning: An analysis of definitions of culture. In J. R. Baldwin, S. L. Faulkner, M. L. Hecht & S. L. Lindsley, (Eds.), *Redefining Culture* (pp. 27-52). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Feiman-Nemser, S. (1983). Learning to teach. In L. Shulman & G. Sykes (Eds.), *Handbook of teaching and policy* (pp. 150-171). New York, NY: Longman.
- Feiman-Nemser, S. (2001). From preparation to practice: Designing a continuum to strengthen and sustain teaching. *Teachers College Record*, 103(6), 1013-1055.
- Feiman-Nemser, S., & Floden, R. E. (1986). The cultures of teaching. In M. C. Wittrock (Ed.), *Handbook of research on teaching* (3rd ed., pp. 505–26). New York, NY: Macmillan.
- Feiman-Nemser, S., & Parker, M. (1995). Making subject matter part of the conversation in learning to teach. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 41(3), 32-43.
- Finlay, L. (2002). Negotiating the swamp: The opportunity and challenge of reflexivity in research practice. *Qualitative Research*, 2(2), 209–230.
- Flechtner, F., & Chapman, K. (2011). The cultural identities of foreign language teachers. *L2 Journal*, 3(1), 116–140.
- Forzani, F. M. (2014). Understanding "core practices" and “practice-based” teacher education: Learning from the past. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 65(4), 357–368. <http://doi.org/10.1177/0022487114533800>

- Freeman, D., & Johnson, K. (1998). Reconceptualizing the knowledge-base of language teacher education. *TESOL Quarterly*, 32(3), 397–417.
- Freire, P. (1970). *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. New York, NY: Herder and Herder.
- Galloway, N., & Rose, H. (2015). *Introducing global Englishes*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Gandana, I. (2014). *ELT, interculturality, and teacher identity: An inquiry into Indonesian university teachers' beliefs and practices*. (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Monash University, Melbourne, Australia.
- Garet, M. S., Porter, A. C., Desimone, L., Birman, B. F., & Yoon, K. S. (2001). What makes professional development effective? Results from a national sample of teachers. *American Educational Research Journal*, 38(4), 915–945. <http://doi.org/10.3102/00028312038004915>
- Gay, G. (2000). *Culturally responsive teaching: Theory, research, and practice*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- Geertz, C. (1979). Deep plan: Notes on the Balinese cockfight. In P. Rabinow & W. Sullivan (Eds.), *Interpretive Social Science* (pp. 181-223). Berkeley, CA: University of Berkeley.
- Giroux, H. A. (2005). *Border crossings: Cultural workers and the politics of education* (2nd ed.). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Grossman, P. (1990). *The making of a teacher: Teacher knowledge and teacher education*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- Grossman, P., Hammerness, K., & McDonald, M. (2009). Redefining teaching, re-imagining teacher education. *Teachers and teaching: Theory and practice*, 15(2) 273-289.
- Grossman, P., & McDonald, M. (2008). Back to the future: Directions for research in teaching and teacher education. *American Educational Research Journal*, 45(1), 184–205. <http://doi.org/10.3102/0002831207312906>
- Grossman, P., & Stodolsky, S. (1995). Content as context: The role of school subjects in secondary school teaching. *Educational Researcher*, 24(8), 3-11.
- Grossman, P., Wilson, S., & Shulman, L.S. (1989). Teachers of substance: Subject matter knowledge for teaching. In M. Reynolds (Ed.), *Knowledge base for the beginning teacher* (pp. 23-36). New York, NY: Pergamon.
- Guba, E., & Lincoln, Y. (2005). Paradigmatic controversies, contradictions, and emerging confluences. In N. Denzin & Y. Lincoln (Eds.), *The Sage handbook of qualitative research* (3rd ed., pp. 191-215). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Hall, E. T. (1959). *The silent language*. New York, NY: Doubleday.
- Hall, E. T., & Hall, M.R. (1990). *Understanding cultural differences*. Yarmouth, ME: Intercultural Press.

- Harklau, L. (1999). Representing culture in the ESL writing classroom. In E. Hinkel (Ed.), *Culture in second language teaching and learning* (pp. 109–130). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Hofstede, G. (2003). *Culture's consequences: Comparing values, behaviors, institutions and organizations across nations*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Hofstede, G. H., Hofstede, G. J., & Minkov, M. (2010). *Cultures and organizations: Software of the mind* (3rd ed.). New York, NY: McGraw-Hill.
- Holliday, A. (1999). Small cultures. *Applied Linguistics*, 20(2), 237–264.
- Holliday, A. (2009). The role of culture in English language education: Key challenges. *Language and Intercultural Communication*, 9(3), 144–155. <http://doi.org/10.1080/14708470902748814>
- Houghten, S. A., & Huang, M. L. (2018). Incorporating environmental action into intercultural dialogue: Personal and environmental transformation and the development of intercultural communicative competence. In M. Byram, I. Golubeva, H. Han, & M. Wagner (Eds.), *From principles to practice in education for intercultural citizenship*. Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Hoy, A. W., & Spero, R. B. (2005). Changes in teacher efficacy during the early years of teaching: A comparison of four measures. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 21(4), 343–356. <http://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2005.01.007>
- Huberman, M. (1989). The professional life cycle of teachers. *Teachers College Record*, 91(1), 31-57.
- Hyde, M. (1998). Intercultural competence in English language education. *Modern English Teacher* 7(2) 7–11.
- Hymes, D.H. (1972). On communicative competence. In J. Pride & J. Holmes (Eds.). *Sociolinguistics* (pp. 269-293). Harmondsworth, UK: Penguin.
- Hymes, D.H. (1974) *Foundations in sociolinguistics: An ethnographic approach*. Philadelphia, PA: University of Pennsylvania Press.
- Illich, I. (1971). *Deschooling society*. New York, NY: Harper & Row.
- Jedynak, M. (2011). The attitudes of English teachers towards developing intercultural communicative competence. In J. Arabski, (Ed.), *Aspects of culture in second language acquisition and foreign language learning* (pp. 63–73). Berlin, Germany: Springer. http://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-642-20201-8_6
- Jenkins, J. (2006). Current perspectives on teaching world Englishes and English as a lingua franca. *TESOL Quarterly*, 40(1), 157–181.
- Jenkins, J. (2009). English as a lingua franca: Interpretations and attitudes. *World Englishes*, 28(2), 200–207.
- Kachru, B. (1986). *The alchemy of English*. Oxford, UK: Pergamon.

- Kartono, G. (1976). Kedudukan dan fungsi bahasa asing di Indonesia. In A. Halim (Ed.), *Politik bahasa nasional* (Vol. 2, pp. 117-126). Jakarta, Indonesia: Pusat Pembinaan dan Pengembangan Bahasa.
- Kearney, E. (2016). *Intercultural learning in modern language education*. Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Keating Marshall, K., & Bokhorst-Heng, W. D. (2018). "I wouldn't want to impose!": Intercultural mediation in French immersion. *Foreign Language Annals*, 51(2), 290–312.
- Kementerian Pendidikan Nasional. (2011). *Panduan pelaksanaan pendidikan karakter*. Jakarta: Author.
- Kennedy, M. M. (1999). The role of preservice teacher education. In L. Darling-Hammond & G. Sykes (Eds.), *Teaching as the learning profession: Handbook of policy and practice* (pp. 54–85). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Kennedy, M. M. (2008). Contributions of qualitative research to research on teacher qualifications. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 30(4), 344–367.
<http://doi.org/10.3102/0162373708326031>
- Kennedy, M. (2016). Parsing the practice of teaching. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 67(1), 6–17.
<http://doi.org/10.1177/0022487115614617>
- Kentner, M. A. (2005). *Successful teachers of Spanish who commit to the teaching of cultures: Two qualitative case studies* (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). The Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio.
- Kohler, M. (2015). *Teachers as mediators in the foreign language classroom*. Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Kramersch, C. (1993). *Context and culture in language teaching*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Kramersch, C. (1995) The applied linguist and the foreign language teacher: Can they talk to each other? In G. Cook, (Ed.) *Principle & practice in applied linguistics: Studies in honour of H.G. Widdowson* (pp. 43-56). Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Kramersch, C. (1996). The cultural component of language teaching. *Language, Culture and Curriculum*, 8(2), 83–92. <http://doi.org/10.1080/07908319509525192>
- Kramersch, C. (2004). The language teacher as go-between. *Education and Democracy*, 13(3), 37–60.
- Kubota, R. (1999). Japanese culture constructed by discourses: Implications for applied linguistics research and ELT. *TESOL Quarterly*, 33(1), 9–35.
- Kumaravadivelu, B. (2008). *Cultural globalization and language education*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.
- Ladson-Billings, G. (1992). Reading between the lines and beyond the pages: A culturally relevant approach to literacy teaching. *Theory Into Practice*, 31(4), 312–320.

- Ladson-Billings, G. (2009). *The dreamkeepers: Successful teachers of African American children*. Hoboken, NJ: Wiley & Sons.
- Ladson-Billings, G. (2014). Culturally relevant pedagogy 2.0: A.k.a. the remix. *Harvard Educational Review*, 84(1), 74–84.
- Lange, D. (1999). Planning for and using the new national culture standards. In J. K. Phillips (Ed.), *Foreign language standards: Linking research, theories, and practices*. Lincolnwood, IL: National Textbook Company.
- Larzén, E. (2005). *In pursuit of an intercultural dimension in EFL teaching: Exploring cognitions among Finland-Swedish comprehensive school teachers*. Biskopsgatan, Finland: Abo Akedemi University Press.
- Larzén-Östermark, E. (2008). The intercultural dimension in EFL teaching: A study of conceptions among Finland-Swedish comprehensive school teachers. *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research*, 52(5), 527–547. <http://doi.org/10.1080/00313830802346405>
- Lantolf, J. P., & Pavlenko, A. (2001). (S)econd (L)anguage (A)ctivity theory: Understanding second language learners as people. In Breen, M. (Ed.) *Learner contributions to language learning: New directions in research* (pp. 141-158). Mahwah, NJ: Routledge.
- Lauder, A. (2008). The status and function of English in Indonesia: A review of key factors. *Makara, Social Humaniora*, 12(1), 9–20.
- Lazaraton, A. (2003). Incidental displays of cultural knowledge in the nonnative-English-speaking teacher's classroom. *TESOL Quarterly*, 37(2), 213–245.
- Lee, E. (2014). Doing culture, doing race: Everyday discourses of 'culture' and 'cultural difference' in the English as a second language classroom. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 36(1), 80–93. <http://doi.org/10.1080/01434632.2014.892503>
- Lessard-Clouston, M. (1996). Chinese teachers' views of culture in their EFL learning and teaching. *Language, Culture and Curriculum*, 9(3), 197–224.
- Lévi-Strauss, C. (1963). *Structural anthropology*. (C. Jacobson & B. Grundfest Schoepf, Trans.). New York, NY: Basic Books.
- Li, Y. (2016). Intercultural awareness in foreign language teaching: A Chinese perspective. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 7(4), 768–772. <http://doi.org/10.17507/jltr.0704.18>
- Lieberman, A., & Miller, L. (Eds.). (1991). *Staff development for education in the 90s*. New York, NY: Teachers' College.
- Lippi-Green, R. (2011). *English with an accent: Language, ideology and discrimination in the United States*. London, UK: Routledge.
- Liston, D., Whitcomb, J., & Borko, H. (2006). Too little or too much. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 57(4), 351–358. <http://doi.org/10.1177/0022487106291976>

- Little, J. W. (2002). Locating learning in teachers' communities of practice: Opening up problems of analysis in records of everyday work. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 18*(8), 917–946.
- López, F. A. (2016). Culturally responsive pedagogies in Arizona and Latino students' achievement. *Teachers College Record, 118*(5), 1–42.
- Lortie, D. (1975). *Schoolteacher: A sociological study*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Low, E. L. (2015). *Pronunciation for English as an international language*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Lucas, T., & Grinberg, J. (2008). Responding to the linguistic reality of mainstream classrooms: Preparing all teachers to teach English language learners. In M. Cochran-Smith, S. Feiman-Nemser, D. J. McIntyre, & K. E. Demers (Eds.), *Handbook of research on teacher education* (3rd ed., pp. 606–636). New York, NY: Routledge.
- Luk, J. (2012). Teachers' ambivalence in integrating culture with EFL teaching in Hong Kong. *Language, Culture and Curriculum, 25*(3), 249–264.
- Lundgren, U. (2018). Intercultural encounters in teacher education – collaboration towards intercultural citizenship. In M. Byram, I. Golubeva, H. Han, & M. Wagner (Eds.), *From principles to practice in education for intercultural citizenship* (pp. 45-78). Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Mahbouba, M. (2014). The teaching of English culture in Algerian secondary schools: The case of second year classes. *Arab World English Journal, 5*(1), 167–179.
- Mambu, J. E. (2015). Challenges in assessing character education in ELT: Implications from a case study in a Christian university. *TEFLIN Journal, 26*(2), 183–208.
<http://doi.org/10.15639/teflinjournal.v26i2/183-208>
- Marx, H., & Moss, D. M. (2011). Please mind the culture gap: Intercultural development during a teacher education study abroad program. *Journal of Teacher Education, 62*(1), 35-47.
- Mawoda, K. R. A. (2011). *Exploring secondary teachers' perceptions towards teaching intercultural competence in Bahrain in English language classroom*. (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). University of Exeter, Exeter, UK.
- McKay, S. L. (2000). Teaching English as an international languages: Implications for cultural materials in the classroom. *TESOL Journal, 9*(4), 1–5.
- McKay, S. L. (2003). Toward an appropriate EIL pedagogy: Re-examining common ELT assumptions. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics, 13*(1), 1–22.
- Menard-Warwick, J. (2008). The cultural and intercultural identities of transnational English teachers: Two case studies from the Americas. *TESOL Quarterly, 42*(4), 617–640.
- Menard-Warwick, J. (2009). Co-constructing representations of culture in ESL and EFL classrooms: Discursive faultlines in Chile and California. *The Modern Language Journal, 93*(1), 30–45.

- Moll, L. C., Amanti, C., Neff, D., & Gonzalez, N. (1992). Funds of knowledge for teaching: Using a qualitative approach to connect homes and classrooms. *Theory into practice, 31*(2), 132-141.
- Moss, P. A., Phillips, D. C., Erickson, F. D., Floden, R. E., Lather, P. A., & Schneider, B. L. (2009). Learning from our differences: A dialogue across perspectives on quality in education research. *Educational Researcher, 38*(7), 501-517.
- Munby, H., & Russell, T. (1992). Transforming chemistry research into chemistry teaching: The complexities of adopting new frames for experience. In T. Russell & H. Munby (Eds.), *Teachers and teaching: From classroom to reflection* (pp. 90-123). London, UK: Falmer.
- Musthafa, B. (2002). English teaching in Indonesia: Status, issues and challenges. *ESL Magazine, 5*(1), 26-28.
- National Council of State Supervisors for Languages (NCSSFL), & American Council on the Teaching of Foreign Languages (ACTFL) (2017). *Intercultural can-do statements*. Retrieved from <https://www.actfl.org/publications/guidelines-and-manuals/ncssfl-actfl-can-do-statements>
- The National Standards Collaborative Board. (2015). *World-readiness standards for learning languages* (4th ed.). Alexandria, VA: Author.
- National Standards in Foreign Language Education Project. (1996). *National standards for foreign language learning: Preparing for the 21st century*. Lawrence, KS: Allen Press.
- Nieto, S. (2017). On becoming sociocultural mediators. *Teaching Works Working Papers, 1*–17.
- Norton, B. (1997). Language, identity, and the ownership of English. *TESOL Quarterly, 31*(3), 409–429.
- Oakes, M.P. (2009). Javanese. In B. Comrie (Ed.), *The world's major languages*. London, UK: Routledge.
- OECD/Asian Development Bank. (2015). *Education in Indonesia: Rising to the challenge*. Paris, France: OECD.
- Osman, H. A. (2015). *Investigating English teachers' perceptions of intercultural communicative competence in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia*. (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). University of San Francisco, San Francisco, California.
- Otwinowska-Kasztelanic, A. (2011). Do we need to teach culture and how much culture do we need? In J. Arabski, (Ed.), *Aspects of culture in second language acquisition and foreign language learning* (pp. 35–48). Berlin, Germany: Springer. http://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-642-20201-8_4
- Paikeday, T. M., & Chomsky, N. (1985). *The native speaker is dead! An informal discussion of a linguistic myth with Noam Chomsky and other linguists, philosophers, psychologists, and lexicographers*. Toronto, Canada: Paikeday Publishers.
- Pajares, M. F. (1992). Teachers' beliefs and educational research: Cleaning up a messy construct. *Review of Educational Research, 62*(3), 307–332.

- Paris, D. (2012). Culturally sustaining pedagogy: A needed change in stance, terminology, and practice. *Educational Researcher*, 41(3), 93–97.
- Paris, D. (2015). The right to culturally sustaining language education for the new American mainstream: An introduction. *International Multilingual Research Journal*, 9(4), 221–226.
- Paris, D., & Alim, H. S. (2014). What are we seeking to sustain through culturally sustaining pedagogy? A loving critique forward. *Harvard Educational Review*, 84(1), 85–100.
- Patton, M. (1990). *Qualitative evaluation and research methods*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.
- Peck, C., & Wagner, M. (2018). Understanding intercultural citizenship in Korea and the USA. In M. Byram, I. Golubeva, H. Han & M. Wagner (Eds.), *From principles to practice in education for intercultural citizenship* (pp. 159-180). Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Peiser, G., & Jones, M. (2014). The influence of teachers' interests, personalities and life experiences in intercultural languages teaching. *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice* 20(3), 375-390.
- Pennycook, A. (1994). *The cultural politics of English as an international language*. Harlow, UK: Longman.
- Pennycook, A. (1999). Introduction: Critical approaches to TESOL. *TESOL Quarterly*, 33(3), 329-348.
- Pennycook, A. (2010). *Language as a local practice*. London, UK: Routledge.
- Purcell-Gates, V. (2011). Ethnographic research. In N. K. Duke & M. H. Mallette (Eds.), *Literacy research methodologies* (2nd ed.). New York, NY: Guilford Press.
- Porto, M. (2015). Ecological and intercultural citizenship in the primary English as a foreign language (EFL) classroom: An online project in Argentina. *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 46(4), 395–415.
- Porto, M. (2018). Mural art and graffiti: Developing intercultural citizenship in higher education classes in English as a foreign language in Argentina and Italy. In M. Byram, I. Golubeva, H. Han, & M. Wagner (Eds.), *From principles to practice in education for intercultural citizenship* (pp. 181-198). Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Porto, M., Daryai-Hansen, P., Arcuri, M. E., & Schifler, K. (2018). Green kidz: Young learners engage in intercultural environmental citizenship in an English language classroom in Argentina and Denmark. In M. Byram, I. Golubeva, H. Han, & M. Wagner (Eds.), *From principles to practice in education for intercultural citizenship* (pp. 131-158). Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Rantz, F., & Horan, P. (2005). Exploring intercultural awareness in the primary modern language classroom: The potential of the new model of European language portfolio developed by the Irish modern languages in primary schools initiative (MLPSI). *Language and Intercultural Communication*, 5(3-4), 209–221. <http://doi.org/10.1080/14708470508668896>
- Richards, J. C., & Schmidt, R. (2002). *Longman dictionary of language teaching and applied linguistics* (3rd ed.). London, UK: Pearson.

- Richardson, V. (1996). The role of attitudes and beliefs in learning to teach. In J. Sikula (Ed.), *Handbook of research on teacher education* (2nd ed., pp. 102–119). New York NY: Routledge.
- Risager, K. (2007). *Language and culture pedagogy*. Clevedon, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Robson, S. (2002). *Javanese grammar for students*. Victoria, Australia: Monash University Press.
- Rommel, L., & Byram, M. (2018). Becoming intercultural competent through study and experience abroad. In M. Wagner, D. Conlon Perugini, and M. Byram (Eds.), *Teaching intercultural competence across the age range* (pp. 157–181). Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Ryan, P. M. (1998). Cultural knowledge and foreign language teachers: A case study of a native speaker of English and a native speaker of Spanish. *Language, Culture and Curriculum*, 11(2), 135–153. <http://doi.org/10.1080/07908319808666546>
- Sadtono, E. (1997). *The development of TEFL in Indonesia*. Malang, Indonesia: Penerbit IKIP Malang.
- Santos, H. P. O., Black, A. M., & Sandelowski, M. (2015). Timing of translation in cross-language qualitative research. *Qualitative Health Research*, 25(1), 134–144. <http://doi.org/10.1177/1049732314549603>
- Saville-Troike, M. (2012). *Introducing second language acquisition* (2nd ed.). Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Seidlhofer, B. (2004). Research perspectives on teaching English as a lingua franca. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, 24, 209–239.
- Sercu, L. (2002). Implementing intercultural foreign language education. Belgian, Danish and British teachers' professional self-concepts and teaching practices compared. *Evaluation & Research in Education*, 16(3), 150–165. <http://doi.org/10.1080/09500790208667015>
- Sercu, L. (2006). The foreign language and intercultural competence teacher: The acquisition of a new professional identity. *Intercultural Education*, 17(1), 55–72. <http://doi.org/10.1080/14675980500502321>
- Sercu, L., Bandura, E., Castro, P., Davcheva, L., Laskaridou, C., Lundgren, U., Carmen, M., García, M., & Ryan, P. (2005). *Foreign language teachers and intercultural competence: An international investigation*. Clevedon, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Shahed, F. H. (2013). “Culture” as a skill in undergraduate EFL classrooms. *TEFLIN Journal*, 24(1), 97–112.
- Sharifian, F. (2009). English as an international language: An overview. In F. Sharifian (Ed.), *English as an international language Perspectives and pedagogical issues* (pp. 1–18). Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Shipton, N. (2010). EFL instructors: What kind of cultural tourism image are they promoting? *The International Journal of Learning*, 17(1), 509–523.

- Shulman, L. (1986). Those who understand: Knowledge growth in teaching. *Educational Researcher*, 15(2), 4–14.
- Shulman, L. (1987). Knowledge and teaching: Foundations of the new reform. *Harvard Educational Review*, 57(1), 1-22.
- Siregar, F. (2016). *In pursuit of intercultural communicative competence: An investigation into English language policy and practices at a private university in Indonesia*. (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Victoria University of Wellington, Wellington, New Zealand.
- Skinner, B. F. (1953). *Science and human behavior*. New York, NY: Simon and Schuster.
- Smith, F. (1971). *Understanding reading: A psycholinguistic analysis of reading and learning to read*. New York, NY: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, Incorporated.
- Smith, J. M., & Kovacs, P. E. (2011). The impact of standards-based reform on teachers: The case of ‘No Child Left Behind’. *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice*, 17(2), 201-225.
- Spindler, G., & Spindler, L. (1990). *The American cultural dialogue and its transmission*. London, UK: Falmer.
- Srivastava, P. (2006). Reconciling multiple researcher positionalities and languages in international research. *Research in Comparative and International Education*, 1(3), 210–222.
- Stake, R. E. (1995). *The art of case study research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Stapleton, P. (2004). Culture’s role in TEFL: An attitude survey in Japan. *Language, Culture and Curriculum*, 13(3), 291–305.
- Street, B. V. (1993). Culture is a verb. In D. Graddol, L. Thompson & M. Byram (Eds.), *Language and culture* (pp. 23-43). Clevedon, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Sung, D., & Chen, P.W. (2009). Incorporating English-language cultures into English learning: Viewpoints from university English faculty in Taiwan. *International Journal of Learning*, 16(3), 301–313.
- Takemura, S., & Shimizu, K. (1993). Goals and strategies for science teaching as perceived by elementary teachers in Japan and the United States. *Peabody Journal of Education*, 68(4), 23-33.
- Temple, B., & Young, A. (2004). Qualitative research and translation dilemmas. *Qualitative Research*, 4(2), 161–178. <http://doi.org/10.1177/1468794104044430>
- TESOL International Association (TESOL). (2019). *Standards for initial TESOL pre-K-12 teacher preparation programs*. Alexandria, VA: Author.
- Tilaar, H.A.R. (2002). *Pendidikan, kebudayaan, dan masyarakat madani Indonesia: Strategi reformasi pendidikan nasional*. Bandung, Indonesia: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Tilaar, H.A.R. (2007). *Multikulturalisme*. Bandung, Indonesia: Remaja Rosdakarya.

- Trompenaars, F., & Hampden-Turner, C. (1998). *Riding the waves of culture: Understanding diversity in global business*. New York, NY: McGraw-Hill.
- UNESCO Institute for statistics. (2006). *Teachers and educational quality: Monitoring global needs for 2015* (pp. 1–215). Montreal, Canada: Author.
- Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta. (2014). *Program studi pendidikan Bahasa Inggris*. Yogyakarta, Indonesia: Author.
- Valli, L., Cooper, D., & Franks, L. (1997). Professional development schools and equity: A critical analysis of rhetoric and research. *Review of Research in Education*, 22(2), 251–304.
- Van Houten, J. B., Couet, R., & Fulkerson, G. (2014). From fact to function: How interculturality is changing our view of culture. *The Language Educator*, January, 42–45.
- Vygotsky, L. S. (1978). *Mind in society: The development of higher mental process*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Wagner, M., Conlon Perugini, D., & Byram, M. (2018). *Teaching intercultural competence across the age range*. Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Ward, M. J., & Ward, C. J. (2003). Promoting cross-cultural competence in preservice teachers through second language use. *Education*, 123(3), 532–536, 638.
- Waterworth, P. (2016). Teaching English in ASEAN: The voices of English teachers in ASEAN nations. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 5(2), 154–163. <http://doi.org/10.17509/ijal.v5i2.1340>
- Watson-Gegeo, K. A. (2017). Ethnography in ESL: Defining the essentials. *TESOL Quarterly*, 22(4), 575–592.
- Watt, D. (2007). On becoming a qualitative researcher: The value of reflexivity. *The Qualitative Report*, 12(1), 82–101.
- Webster-Wright, A. (2009). Reframing professional development through understanding authentic professional learning. *American Educational Research Journal*, 79(2), 702–739.
- Westbrook, J., Shah, N., Durrani, N., Tikly, C., Khan, W., & Dunne, M. (2009). Becoming a teacher: Transitions from training to the classroom in North West Frontier Province, Pakistan. *International Journal of Educational Development* 29(4), 437–444.
- Widdowson, H. G. (1994). The ownership of English. *TESOL Quarterly*, 28(2), 377–389.
- Wilbur, M. (2007). How foreign language teachers get taught: Methods of teaching the methods course. *Foreign Language Annals*, 40(1), 79–101.
- Wilson, S., & Berne, J. (1999). Teacher learning and the acquisition of professional knowledge: An examination of research on contemporary professional development. *Review of Research in Education*, 24, 173–209.

- Yamada, E., & Hsieh, J. (2018). Beyond language barriers: Approaches to developing citizenship for lower-level language classes. In M. Byram, I. Golubeva, H. Han & M. Wagner (Eds.), *From principles to practice in education for intercultural citizenship* (pp. 81-103). Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Yang, X., & Chen, D. (2014). Do instructors' perceptions on teaching culture in foreign language classroom make a difference: Lessons from a qualitative study of language instructors and learners. *The Journal of Language Teaching and Learning*, 4(2), 1–14.
- Yang, X., & Chen, D. (2016). Two barriers to teaching culture in foreign language classroom. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 6(5), 1128–1135. <http://doi.org/10.17507/tpls.0605.29>
- Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case study research* (4th ed.). Los Angeles, CA: Sage.
- Young, T. J., & Sachdev, I. (2011). Intercultural communicative competence: Exploring English language teachers' beliefs and practices. *Language Awareness*, 20(2), 81–98. <http://doi.org/10.1080/09658416.2010.540328>
- Young, T. J., Sachdev, I., & Seedhouse, P. (2009). Teaching and learning culture on English language programmes: A critical review of the recent empirical literature. *Innovation in Language Learning and Teaching*, 3(2), 149–169. <http://doi.org/10.1080/17501220802283178>
- Yulita, L., & Porto, M. (2018). Human rights education in language teaching. In M. Byram, I. Golubeva, H. Han, & M. Wagner (Eds.), *From principles to practice in education for intercultural citizenship* (pp. 225-250). Bristol, UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Zabetipour, M., & Baghi, B. A. (2015). The impact of EFL teachers' years of experience on their cultural identity. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 5(2), 330–335. <http://doi.org/10.17507/tpls.0502.12>
- Zeichner, K. (2012). The turn once again toward practice-based teacher education. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 63(5), 376–382. <http://doi.org/10.1177/0022487112445789>
- Zeichner, K. M., & Gore, J. M. (1990). Teacher socialization. In W. R. Houston (Ed.), *Handbook of research on teacher education* (pp. 329–348). New York, NY: Macmillan.
- Zeichner, K. M., & Tabachnick, B. R. (1981). Are the effects of university teacher education washed out by school experience?. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 32(3), 7-11.
- Zein, S. (2015). Factors affecting the professional development of elementary English teachers. *Professional Development in Education*, 42(3), 423–440. <http://doi.org/10.1080/19415257.2015.1005243>
- Zellermayer, M., & Tabak, E. (2006). Knowledge construction in a teachers' community of enquiry: A possible road map. *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice*, 12(1), 33-49.
- Zentella, A. C. (2005). *Building on strengths: Language and literacy in Latino families and communities*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.